Trademark Protection and Freedom of Expression

An Inquiry into the Conflict between Trademark Rights and Freedom of Expression under European Law

Wolfgang Sakulin
The titles published in this series are listed at the back of this volume.
# Table of Contents

**Preface and Acknowledgement** v  
**List of Abbreviations** xv  

## Chapter 1: Introduction  
1. **Trademark Protection versus Freedom of Expression:** Introduction to a Possible Conflict  
   1.2. The Evolution of the Conflict Over Trademark Use  
      1.2.1. Key Elements of the Conflict  
         1.2.1.1. Two Basic Functions of Trademarks  
         1.2.1.2. The Idiosyncrasy of Trademarks  
         1.2.1.3. Monologic and Dialogic Communication  
      1.2.2. Trademarks as Identifiers  
      1.2.3. A Change in Advertising Paradigms: From Identifiers to Communicators  
      1.2.4. Emergence of a Political Dimension to the Conflict  
      1.2.5. Emergence of a Social and Cultural Dimension of the Conflict  
      1.2.6. Conflicts in the New Media  
   1.3. Research Question and Outline  
   1.4. Limitation of the Subject Matter  
   1.5. A Comparative Perspective  

## Chapter 2: Trademark Rights and Their Rationales  
2.1. Introduction  
2.2. A Bird’s-Eye View of European Trademark Law
### Table of Contents

1. **The European Trademark Law Framework**
   - 2.2.1. The European Trademark Law Framework
   - 2.2.2. The Grant and Revocation of Trademark Rights
     - 2.2.2.1. Grounds for Refusal of Registration
     - 2.2.2.2. Revocation of Registration
   - 2.2.3. The Scope of Trademark Rights
     - 2.2.3.1. Identity Protection and Protection against Confusing Use
       - 2.2.3.1.1. ‘Identity Protection’ under Article 5.1.a TMDir
       - 2.2.3.1.2. Protection against Confusion under Article 5.1.b TMDir
     - 2.2.3.2. Protection of the Distinctive Character and Repute
       - 2.2.3.2.1. Use in Relation to Goods and Services
       - 2.2.3.2.2. Free-Riding, Blurring, and Tarnishment
       - 2.2.3.2.3. Article 5.5 TMDir
     - 2.2.4. Limitations of Trademark Rights
   - 2.3. Rationales for the Grant and Scope of Trademark Rights
     - 2.3.1. Trademark Functions in Trade
       - 2.3.1.1. Source Identification Function
       - 2.3.1.2. Product Distinction Function
       - 2.3.1.3. Quality or Guarantee Function
       - 2.3.1.4. Goodwill and Advertising Function
       - 2.3.1.5. The ‘Essential Function’ of Trademarks as Viewed by the ECJ
     - 2.3.2. Economic Rationales
       - 2.3.2.1. Background
       - 2.3.2.2. Lowered Search-Costs and Dynamic Efficiency
       - 2.3.2.3. Protection of the Goodwill and Advertising Function
         - 2.3.2.3.1. Lowered Search Costs
         - 2.3.2.3.2. Dynamic Efficiency
         - 2.3.2.3.3. Trademarks as Psychological Commodities
       - 2.3.2.4. ‘Perception Advertising’ and Negative Effects on Rationality
     - 2.3.3. Ethical and Fairness-Based Rationales
       - 2.3.3.1. Unfair Competition and the Underlying Principles of Truth and Unjust Enrichment
       - 2.3.3.2. Truthfulness
   - 2.4. Interim Conclusion
   - 2.5. Final Conclusion
   - 3. Recommendations
   - 4. Appendices
     - 4.1. List of Acronyms
     - 4.2. List of Abbreviations
     - 4.3. List of Cases
   - 5. Bibliography
Table of Contents

2.3.3.3. Unjust Enrichment as a Principle 71
2.3.3.4. An Extended Version of Lockean Labour Rationale 75
  2.3.3.2.1. Protection of the Goodwill and Advertising Function 76
  2.3.3.2.2. Limitations 78
2.3.3.5. Interim Conclusion 79

2.4. Trademark Rights in Light of the Rationales 80
  2.4.1. The Grant and Revocation of Trademark Rights 80
    2.4.1.1. Grounds for Refusal of Registration 82
    2.4.1.2. Revocation of Registration 83
  2.4.2. Identity Protection and Protection against Confusing Use
    2.4.2.1. Identity Protection 85
    2.4.2.2. Protection against Confusion 86
    2.4.2.3. Level of Proof for the Protection against Confusion 87
  2.4.3. Protection of Distinctive Character and Repute 88
    2.4.3.1. The Definition of ‘Reputation’ 89
    2.4.3.2. Use in Relation to Goods and Services 91
    2.4.3.3. Taking Unfair Advantage 92
    2.4.3.4. Blurring 97
    2.4.3.5. Tarnishment 99
    2.4.3.6. Article 5.5 TMDir 100
  2.4.4. Limitations of Trademark Rights 101
2.5. Conclusion 104

Chapter 3
Freedom of Expression as a Possible Limitation to Trademark Rights 109

3.1. Introduction 109
3.2. A Bird’s-Eye View of the Provisions Protecting Freedom of Expression 111
  3.2.1. Article 10 ECHR 111
  3.2.2. Freedom of Expression under EU Law 113
  3.2.3. Freedom of Expression under United Kingdom Law 115
  3.2.4. Freedom of Expression under Dutch Law 115
  3.2.5. Article 5 of the German Grundgesetz 117
3.3. Invoking Freedom of Expression in a Conflict with Trademark Rights 119
  3.3.1. Indirect Horizontal Effect of Article 10 ECHR 120
    3.3.1.1. Indirect Horizontal Effect and Positive Obligations 121
    3.3.1.2. Positive Obligations and Expressive Diversity 122
  2.4. Freedom of Expression under Dutch Law 115
  2.5. Article 5 of the German Grundgesetz 117

Table of Contents ix
Table of Contents

3.3.2. Horizontal Effect of Article 10 ECHR in EU Law 123  
3.3.3. Horizontale Doorwerking in the Dutch Legal Order 124  
3.3.4. Horizontal Effect in the United Kingdom 125  
3.3.5. Mittelbare Drittwirkung of Article 5 GG 126  
3.3.6. The Constitutionalisation of Private Law 128  
3.4. Rationales for Freedom of Expression 130  
3.4.1. General Rationales for Freedom of Non-Commercial Expression 131  
3.4.1.1. Truth, Democracy, and the Role of the State 131  
3.4.1.1.1. Discovering Truth 132  
3.4.1.1.2. Democracy and Control of Power 133  
3.4.1.1.3. Minority Views, Opposition, Exaggeration, and Pluralism 134  
3.4.1.1.4. Limitations 136  
3.4.1.2. The Self-Fulfilment of Individuals 137  
3.4.2. Dialogic Democracy: A Supplementary Rationale for the Use of Trademarks in Non-Commercial Expression 138  
3.4.3. The Rationale for Freedom of Commercial Expression 142  
3.4.4. Interim Conclusion 147  
3.5. The Varying Level of Protection 149  
3.5.1. Non-Commercial Expression 150  
3.5.1.1. Expression on Matters of Public Interest 150  
3.5.1.2. Public Figures and Public Symbols 152  
3.5.1.2.1. Public Figures and Public Symbols 153  
3.5.1.2.2. The Countervailing Interests 155  
3.5.1.3. Artistic Expression 159  
3.5.1.4. Chilling Effects on Public Discourse 163  
3.5.2. Purely Commercial Expression 166  
3.5.3. Mixed-Expression 168  
3.5.3.1. Article 10 ECHR 169  
3.5.3.2. Article 5 GG 174  
3.6. Conclusion 175

Chapter 4  
Balancing the Grant and Revocation of Trademark Rights with Freedom of Expression 181  
4.1 Introduction 181  
4.1.1 General Introduction 181  
4.1.2 The Public Interest Stemming from Freedom of Expression 182  
4.1.3 Outline 187  
4.2 The Grant of Trademark Rights and the Grounds for Refusal 189
4.2.1 The Need for a Critical Assessment at the Time of Registration 189

4.2.2 Ground for Refusal I: Descriptiveness 192
   4.2.2.1 Criteria Found in the Jurisprudence of ECJ and CFI 193
   4.2.2.2 Extending the Notion of Descriptiveness Even Further 199

4.2.3 Ground for Refusal II: Customariness 203

4.2.4 Ground for Refusal III: Non-Distinctiveness 204
   4.2.4.1 Room for Interpretation in Line with Freedom of Expression 205
   4.2.4.2 Laudatory Signs and Slogans 208
   4.2.4.3 Signs of High Social, Cultural, or Political Value 211

4.2.5 Limitation of the Previous Grounds for Refusal: Acquired Distinctiveness 215
   4.2.5.1 Test and Evidence 216
   4.2.5.2 De Jure (Partial) Exclusion from Acquiring Distinctiveness 218

4.2.6 Grounds for Refusal of Bad Faith and Public Order 220
   4.2.6.1 Bad Faith 221
   4.2.6.2 Public Order and Public Policy 222

4.3 The Ground for Revocation for Generic Trademarks 224

4.4 Conclusion 227

Chapter 5
Balancing the Scope of Trademark Rights with Freedom of Expression 231

5.1. Introduction 231
   5.1.1. General Introduction 231
   5.1.2. The Freedom of Expression at Stake 232
   5.1.3. Outline 235

5.2. Balancing by Interpreting the Constitutive Criteria of the Scope 237
   5.2.1. The Limitation of Trademark Rights to Use in the Course of Trade 237
      5.2.1.1. Jurisprudence of the ECJ 238
      5.2.1.2. United Kingdom Trade Marks Act 239
      5.2.1.3. The German Markengesetz 240
      5.2.1.4. Benelux Convention on Intellectual Property (BVIE) 242
      5.2.1.5. Interim Conclusion 245

Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 The Need for a Critical Assessment at the Time of Registration</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 Ground for Refusal I: Descriptiveness</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2.1 Criteria Found in the Jurisprudence of ECJ and CFI</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2.2 Extending the Notion of Descriptiveness Even Further</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3 Ground for Refusal II: Customariness</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4 Ground for Refusal III: Non-Distinctiveness</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4.1 Room for Interpretation in Line with Freedom of Expression</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4.2 Laudatory Signs and Slogans</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4.3 Signs of High Social, Cultural, or Political Value</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.5 Limitation of the Previous Grounds for Refusal: Acquired Distinctiveness</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.5.1 Test and Evidence</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.5.2 De Jure (Partial) Exclusion from Acquiring Distinctiveness</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.6 Grounds for Refusal of Bad Faith and Public Order</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.6.1 Bad Faith</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.6.2 Public Order and Public Policy</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 The Ground for Revocation for Generic Trademarks</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Conclusion</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter 5
Balancing the Scope of Trademark Rights with Freedom of Expression 231

5.1. Introduction 231
   5.1.1. General Introduction 231
   5.1.2. The Freedom of Expression at Stake 232
   5.1.3. Outline 235

5.2. Balancing by Interpreting the Constitutive Criteria of the Scope 237
   5.2.1. The Limitation of Trademark Rights to Use in the Course of Trade 237
      5.2.1.1. Jurisprudence of the ECJ 238
      5.2.1.2. United Kingdom Trade Marks Act 239
      5.2.1.3. The German Markengesetz 240
      5.2.1.4. Benelux Convention on Intellectual Property (BVIE) 242
      5.2.1.5. Interim Conclusion 245

Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 The Need for a Critical Assessment at the Time of Registration</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 Ground for Refusal I: Descriptiveness</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2.1 Criteria Found in the Jurisprudence of ECJ and CFI</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2.2 Extending the Notion of Descriptiveness Even Further</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3 Ground for Refusal II: Customariness</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4 Ground for Refusal III: Non-Distinctiveness</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4.1 Room for Interpretation in Line with Freedom of Expression</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4.2 Laudatory Signs and Slogans</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4.3 Signs of High Social, Cultural, or Political Value</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.5 Limitation of the Previous Grounds for Refusal: Acquired Distinctiveness</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.5.1 Test and Evidence</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.5.2 De Jure (Partial) Exclusion from Acquiring Distinctiveness</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.6 Grounds for Refusal of Bad Faith and Public Order</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.6.1 Bad Faith</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.6.2 Public Order and Public Policy</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 The Ground for Revocation for Generic Trademarks</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Conclusion</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

5.2.2. Identity-Protection and Protection against Confusion 246
  5.2.2.1. Freedom of Commercial Expression and Confusion 247
    5.2.2.1.1. Use in Relation to Goods and Services under Article 5.1 TMDir 248
    5.2.2.1.2. Likelihood of Confusion 250
  5.2.2.2. Freedom of Non-Commercial and Mixed Expression 254
    5.2.2.2.1. Freedom of Non-Commercial and Mixed Expression of Third Parties 254
    5.2.2.2.2. Interpretative Protection of Expressive Diversity 255
  5.2.2.3. Interim Conclusion 260

5.2.3. The Protection of Distinctive Character and Repute 260
  5.2.3.1. Use in Relation to Similar and Dissimilar Goods and Services 263
    5.2.3.1.1. Use under the Warenzeichengesetz 264
    5.2.3.1.2. Use under the Markengesetz 265
  5.2.3.2. Taking Advantage of the Distinctive Character or Repute (Free-Riding) 267
    5.2.3.2.1. Freedom of Commercial Expression 268
    5.2.3.2.2. Freedom of Non-Commercial and Mixed Expression 270
  5.2.3.3. Detriment to the Distinctive Character or Repute (Blurring and Tarnishment) 273
    5.2.3.3.1. Freedom of Commercial Expression 274
    5.2.3.3.2. Freedom of Non-Commercial and Mixed Expression 275
  5.2.3.4. Article 5.5 TMDir and the Benelux Experience 277
  5.2.3.5. Interim Conclusion 280

5.3. Balancing under the Limitations to the Scope 282
  5.3.1. Rejection of an ‘Alternative Means of Expression’ or Necessity Test 283
    5.3.1.1. The Necessity Test for Referential Use and Due Cause 284
### 5.3.1.2. Article 10.2 ECHR

| 5.3.1.2.1. | Freedom of Commercial Expression | 285 |
| 5.3.1.2.2. | Freedom of Non-Commercial and Mixed Expression | 287 |

### 5.3.1.3. Interim Conclusion

#### 5.3.2. Balancing with Freedom of Commercial Expression

| 5.3.2.1. | Confusion | 288 |
| 5.3.2.1.1. | Descriptive Use | 289 |
| 5.3.2.1.2. | Referential Use and Comparative Advertising | 292 |
| 5.3.2.2. | Taking Unfair Advantage (Free-Riding) | 293 |
| 5.3.2.3. | Blurring and Generic Use | 296 |
| 5.3.2.4. | Tarnishment, Discrediting Use, and Denigration | 297 |
| 5.3.2.5. | Interim Conclusion to Freedom of Commercial Expression | 298 |

#### 5.3.3. Balancing with Freedom of Non-Commercial and Mixed Expression

| 5.3.3.1. | Assessing Commerciality in Mixed Expression | 300 |
| 5.3.3.1.1. | Balancing under European Trademark Law | 301 |
| 5.3.3.1.2. | A Non-Commercial Use Exception | 306 |
| 5.3.3.2. | Descriptive Use, Generic Use, and Expressive Diversity | 309 |
| 5.3.3.2.1. | (Expressively) Descriptive and Generic Use | 309 |
| 5.3.3.2.2. | Expressive Diversity | 313 |
| 5.3.3.3. | Use of Trademarks in ‘Meaning Making’ and a Possible Parody Exception | 314 |
| 5.3.3.3.1. | Examples of Meaning Making in Art, Parody, and Criticism | 315 |
| 5.3.3.3.2. | A Parody Exception for Trademark Law? | 317 |

#### 5.3.3.4. Balancing Harm with Freedom of Expression

| 5.3.3.4.1. | Awareness Campaigns | 320 |
| 5.3.3.4.2. | The Criticism of Individuals | 321 |
| 5.3.3.4.3. | Balancing in Extreme Cases | 323 |

### 5.4. Chilling Effects

### 5.5. Conclusion

xiii
Table of Contents

Chapter 6
Summary and Recommendations 337
  6.1 Summary 337
  6.2 Recommendations 345

Annex 353

Bibliography 359

Table of Cases 381